

COMMITTEE REPORT

Team: West Area
Date: 22 June 2006

Ward: Bishopthorpe
Parish: Bishopthorpe Parish Council

Reference: 06/00565/FUL
Application at: 32A Copmanthorpe Lane Bishopthorpe York YO23 2QR
For: Erection of first floor pitched roof extension to create two storey dwelling house, single storey side extension forming garage and front porch (resubmission)
By: Mr And Mrs Burlison
Application Type: Full Application
Target Date: 12 May 2006

1.0 PROPOSAL

1.1 The application is for the erection of a first floor pitched roof extension to create a two storey dwelling house, single storey side extension and front porch (resubmission).

1.2 The dwelling is a large bungalow set back from the building line dating from the 1960s, it is built of white brick and set within a large plot. There are a mixture of style of dwellings within the street, in this part of the street it is red brick two storey semi detached dwellings. Southwest along the road it is small two storey detached dwellings built in the 1960s. North east along Copmanthorpe Lane the dwellings are larger two storey detached dwellings mostly redbrick although some have the first storey rendered, there are also terraces of housing again red brick.

2.0 POLICY CONTEXT

2.1 Development Plan Allocation:

DC Area Teams West Area 0004

City Boundary York City Boundary 0001

Schools Archbishop of York's CE Junior 0183

2.2 Policies:

CYGP1
Design

CYH7
Residential extensions

3.0 CONSULTATIONS

3.1 PUBLICITY DATES/PERIODS

Neighbour Notification - Expires 11/04/2006

Site Notice - N/A

Press Advert - N/A

Internal/External Consultations - Expires 11/04/2006

8 WEEK TARGET DATE 12/05/2006

3.2 INTERNAL CONSULTATIONS

HIGHWAY NETWORK MANAGEMENT - No objections

CONSERVATION (Countryside Officer) - Effectively this means building a new house on the site of the old and will affect the whole roof. There are no records for this property although there are some for the village. Would like a conditions to be applied requiring the roof be removed manually so that a bat check can be carried out and also to incorporate suitable bat features into the design.

3.3 EXTERNAL CONSULTATIONS/REPRESENTATIONS

BISHOPTHORPE PARISH COUNCIL - Object

- Resubmission has changed little from the original application
- The change to the appearance is insufficient to over ride the reason in paragraph 2 of the decision
- The building is set back from the street building line and will have a strong shadowing effect to the rear of No. 32
- Supports the representations made by the owners of No. 32

2 LETTERS OF OBJECTION

- Reason for refusal of the last application have not been addressed
- 32A set back at the rear of the adjacent properties by 5.5 metres
- Additional storey would have an overbearing impact on the rear of the adjacent properties and their gardens but all of the four dwellings due to scale, height, high gable ends and painted render finish
- Prominent from Temple Road and Maclagen Road
- Unsuitable and unsympathetic for the site, surrounding properties and general location
- Direct impact on light to Nos 32 and 34
- Unsuitable for the foundation of a four bedroomed house
- Render finish out of character with the locality

4.0 APPRAISAL

4.1 RELEVANT SITE HISTORY

05/02764/ FUL - Single storey side extension and porch, and construction of first floor over entire ground floor to create a two storey house - Refused

1) The proposed additional storey would be harmful to the character of the street and locality due to its design, scale and height, and would have an overbearing impact upon the adjacent property at 34 Copmanthorpe Lane

2) The proposed external render finish of the existing dwelling and additional storey would be out of character within the locality being unsympathetic to external appearance of the surrounding dwellings

4.2 ADDITIONAL PLANNING POLICY

CYC Supplementary Design Guidance - A guide to extensions and alterations to private dwelling houses, 2001

4.3 KEY ISSUES

1. Visual impact on the dwelling and the area
2. Impact on neighbouring property

4.4 ASSESSMENT

PLANNING POLICY

4.4.1 Policy GP1 'Design' of the City of York Local Plan Deposit Draft includes the expectation that development proposals will, inter alia; respect or enhance the local environment; be of a density, layout, scale, mass and design that is compatible with neighbouring buildings and spaces, ensure residents living nearby are not unduly affected by noise, disturbance overlooking, overshadowing or dominated by overbearing structures, use materials appropriate to the area; avoid the loss of open spaces or other features that contribute to the landscape; incorporate appropriate landscaping and retain, enhance or create urban spaces, public views, skyline, landmarks and other features that make a significant contribution to the character of the area.

4.4.2 Policy H7 'Residential Extensions' of the City of York Local Plan Deposit Draft sets out a list of design criteria against which proposals for house extensions are considered. The list includes the need to ensure that the design and scale are appropriate in relation to the main building; that proposals respect the character of area and spaces between dwellings; and that there should be no adverse effect on the amenity that neighbouring residents could reasonably expect to enjoy.

VISUAL IMPACT ON THE DWELLING AND THE AREA

4.4.3 The previous application proposed the construction of a first floor over entire the ground floor and the garage creating a two storey dwelling to the boundary and was considered not to be in keeping with the character of the street where dwellings are set back from the boundary. The application has removed the first floor extension above the garage and therefore reducing some of the prominent impact on the street scene and the overbearing impact on 34 Copmanthorpe Lane.

4.4.4 The existing dwelling is set back from the well defined building line within Copmanthorpe Lane, so although its one storey design and materials have been out of character with the area the negative impact on the street scene has been lessened by the set back from the building line. The proposed dwelling has a less cramped appearance than the previous application due to the removal of the first floor above the garage. A two storey dwelling on this site would be in keeping with the character of the locality.

4.4.5 The previous application kept the ground floor as white brick and had the first floor as a render finish, it was considered that this would be incongruous to the character of the street making the proposed dwelling very prominent within the street. This application proposes that the whole dwelling would be a render finish of initially a terracotta colour finish although the agent stated that the applicants would prefer magnolia white. The terracotta finish would have less impact on the street than a magnolia finish as the colour has some relation to the colour of the surrounding dwellings. The render finish would not have the variation of colours that the surrounding red brick dwellings have and would.

4.4.6 The existing bungalow looks out of character with the surrounding properties due to its design, height etc but mainly the white bricks used. The addition of another storey of a magnolia colour would further compound the negative impact on the character of the area and increase the prominence of the dwelling in the street scene. Other dwellings in the street have a rendered first storey in a range of colours although the ground storey is red brick;

these dwellings are smaller in size and footprint than the proposed dwelling. This application has not dealt with the reason for refusal of the previous application and the proposed finish is still considered to be out of character within the locality being unsympathetic to external appearance of the surrounding dwellings.

IMPACT ON NEIGHBOURING PROPERTY

4.4.7 There would be no overlooking caused by the proposed extension the window in the side elevation is a bathroom window and could be conditioned to be obscure glazing.

4.4.8 The dwelling is along a northeast southwest axis and set back from the rear building line by around 5 metres which may cause an issue of loss of light and overshadowing. The additional storey may create a loss of light to the extension of 32 Copmanthorpe Lane there may be a loss of light to a lesser extent to 34 Copmanthorpe Lane. The proposed height of the dwelling would be 8.5 metres to the ridge height, and 5.2 metres to the eave height. The height of the existing dwelling at the ridge height is 5.8 metres and 2.4 metres to the eave height.

4.4.9 It is not considered that the proposed side extension would have an overbearing impact on the occupants of specifically 32 Copmanthorpe Lane and to a lesser extent 34 Copmanthorpe Lane that would not be harmful enough to warrant refusal. However two storeys of white render may increase the overbearing impact.

5.0 CONCLUSION

5.1 Whilst it is considered that there is scope for a two storey dwelling on this site the proposed external render finish and proposed colours of the existing dwelling and additional storey would be out of character within the locality being unsympathetic to the external appearance of the surrounding dwellings.

COMMITTEE TO VISIT

6.0 RECOMMENDATION: Refuse

- 1 The proposed external rendered finish of the existing dwelling and additional storey would be out of character within the locality being unsympathetic to external appearance of the surrounding dwellings. The proposal is therefore contrary to Policy GB1 (sub section b) and Policy H7 (sub section a) of the City of York Development Control Local Plan (April 2005).

7.0 INFORMATIVES:

Contact details:

Author: Victoria Bell Development Control Officer
Tel No: 01904 551347